

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----X  
VIRGINIA L. GIUFFRE,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
GHISLAINE MAXWELL,  
Defendant.  
-----X

**15-cv-07433-RWS**

**Declaration Of Laura A. Menninger In Further Support Of Motion To Compel Responses to Defendant's First Set of Discovery Requests to Plaintiff**

I, Laura A. Menninger, declare as follows:

1. I am an attorney at law duly licensed in the State of New York and admitted to practice in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. I am a member of the law firm Haddon, Morgan & Foreman, P.C., counsel of record for Defendant Ghislaine Maxwell ("Maxwell") in this action. I respectfully submit this declaration in support of Defendant's Reply In Support of Motion to Compel Responses to Defendant's First Set of Discovery Requests to Plaintiff.

2. On April 5, 2016, I spoke by telephone with Assistant United States Attorney Marie Villafana, counsel of record in *Jane Doe #1 and Jane Doe #2 v. United States*, #08-80736-CIV, pending in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida, otherwise known as the Crime Victims Rights Act case.

3. Ms. Villafana advised me that her office is not conducting any criminal investigation of Ms. Ghislaine Maxwell. She also advised me that she is unaware of any law

enforcement agency who is conducting an active criminal investigation of Ghislaine Maxwell.

4. Attached as Exhibit D is a true and correct copy of pages 1, 16 and 17 from Plaintiff's Revised Disclosure Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26.

By: /s/ Laura A. Menninger  
Laura A. Menninger

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on April 11, 2016, I electronically served this *DECLARATION OF LAURA A. MENNINGER IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF MOTION TO COMPEL RESPONSES TO DEFENDANT'S FIRST SET OF DISCOVERY REQUESTS TO PLAINTIFF* via ECF on the following:

Sigrid S. McCawley  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER, LLP  
401 East Las Olas Boulevard, Ste. 1200  
Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301  
smccawley@bsflp.com

/s/ Nicole Simmons  
Nicole Simmons

# **EXHIBIT D**

**United States District Court  
Southern District of New York**

Virginia L. Giuffre,

Plaintiff,

Case No.: 15-cv-07433-RWS

v.

Ghislaine Maxwell,

Defendant.

**PLAINTIFF, VIRGINIA GIUFFRE'S REVISED DISCLOSURE  
PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. P. 26**

COMES NOW the Plaintiff, Virginia L. Giuffre, by and through her undersigned counsel,  
and serves this revised disclosure pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 and states as follows:

**A. Witnesses:**

1. Virginia L. Giuffre  
c/o Sigrid S. McCawley, Esq.  
Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP  
401 East Las Olas Boulevard, Suite 1200  
Miami, Florida 33301  
Tel: (954) 356-0011  
Email: [smccawley@bsfllp.com](mailto:smccawley@bsfllp.com)

Plaintiff - information regarding Defendant, Ghislaine Maxwell's conduct that is  
the subject of this action

2. Ghislaine Maxwell  
c/o Laura A. Menninger, Esq.  
HADDON, MORGAN & FOREMAN, P.C.  
150 East 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
Denver, Colorado 80203  
Tel: (303) 831-7364  
Email: [lmenninger@hmflaw.com](mailto:lmenninger@hmflaw.com)

Defendant in this action.

- iii. Giuffre needs continuing care as a result of the harm she has suffered. Ms. Giuffre was born August 9, 1983 and was 31.4 years old at the beginning of 2015 when the alleged harm occurred. The average remaining life expectancy for a 31 year old female is 51.1 years.
- iv. Based on a remaining life expectancy of 51.1 years, annual healthcare cost growth of 3.3% and a discount rate of 2.7%, the present value of expected treatment costs is \$102,200 as of 1/1/2015.

b. **Supporting Evidence:**

- i. Ms. Giuffre is in the process of collecting records from her physicians
- ii. Ms. Giuffre's testimony
- iii. Ms. Giuffre is in the process of retaining an expert to calculate damages, and will provide further information through expert disclosure.

2. Past, present and future pain and suffering, mental anguish, humiliation, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, loss of standing in the community, loss of dignity and invasion of privacy in her public and private life not less than \$30,000,000.00.

a. **Computation Analysis**

- i. Under New York law, defamation per se as alleged in this case presumes damages and special damages do not need to be plead and proven. *See Celle v. Filipino Reporter Enterprises Inc.*, 209 F.3d 163, 179 (2<sup>nd</sup> Cir. 2000) (Second Circuit holding that "[i]f a statement is defamatory per se, injury is assumed. In such a case 'even where the plaintiff can show no actual damages at all, a plaintiff who has otherwise shown defamation may recover at least nominal damages' and the Second Circuit also confirmed an award of punitive damages). Ms. Giuffre has been severely damaged by the defamation of the defendant, by calling her claims of sexual abuse "obvious lies". The defamation caused Ms. Giuffre to re-live the sexual abuse she previously endured. Ms. Giuffre has suffered and continues to suffer from the pain, mental anguish, humiliation, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, loss of standing in the community, loss of dignity and invasion of privacy in her public and private life. The computation of this amount is in the province of the jury but Ms. Giuffre contends, including but not limited to, awards in other similar matters, that the

amount is not less than \$30,000,000.00. Ms. Giuffre is in the process of retaining an expert, and will provide further information through expert disclosure.

b. **Supporting Evidence**

- i. Ms. Giuffre's testimony
- ii. Witness testimony
- iii. Awards in similar matters
- iv. Ms. Giuffre is in the process of retaining an expert, and will provide further information through expert disclosure.

3. Estimated lost income of \$180,000 annually. Present value of \$3,461,000 to \$5,407,000.

a. **Computation Analysis**

- i. Ms. Giuffre's estimated compensation capacity is \$180,000 annually. Ms. Giuffre was born August 9, 1983 and was 31.4 years old at the beginning of 2015 when the alleged injury occurred. Her expected remaining work life based on mortality and probability of continued work was 20.2 years. Based on these factors, a 2% annual growth rate and a 2.4% discount rate, the present value of lost compensation is \$3,461,000 as of 1/1/2015.
- ii. Alternatively, if Ms. Giuffre is assumed to work until a normal retirement age of 65, or 33.6 years from her age at the beginning of 2015, and based on an annual growth rate of 2.0% and a discount rate of 2.7%, the present value of lost compensation is \$5,407,000 as of 1/1/2015.

b. **Supporting Evidence**

- i. Materials regarding compensation and work life expectancy
  - 1) 2010 Life Table for Females, *National Vital Statistics Report*, November 6, 2014, U.S. Department of Health & Human Services, Centers for Disease Control & Prevention, National Center for Health Statistics.