

**From:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**To:** "jeffrey E." <jeevacation@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Re:  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 23, 2015 12:04:20 AM

Depends what thoughts are. If they are statements, questions, promises,..., then surely concepts come before thoughts because they are a prerequisite for thoughts (not conversely).

**From:** jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, December 22, 2015 6:55 PM  
**To:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Subject:** Re:

im not sure conveying thoughts i think concepts might come first. two things. vs one thing

On Tue, Dec 22, 2015 at 5:34 PM, Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]> wrote:

If I understand you correctly, it brings up some very intriguing questions: is language a system for conveying thoughts (mostly internally, to oneself, sometimes externally to others), thoughts that are created by some other systems of mind? Or is it a system that actually constructs the thoughts. If so, then mostly unconsciously and beyond the possibility of introspection. In that latter interpretation, there would be "no sense before language" – except insofar as there is thinking of other kinds, which does not involve language. That seems to me at least to be rather plausible, though how to investigate the matters doesn't seem clear.

As far as I can see, the only aspects of language that could be "reflex" are acquisition and processing of input, which do seem essentially reflexive – like other kinds of growth and immediate perception.

NOam

**From:** jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, December 22, 2015 4:07 PM  
**To:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Subject:**

instead of a sense making module , is it possible that language is that module. ? no sense before language. ? reflex only?

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by

return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com), and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com), and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved