

From: Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>
To: Joscha Bach <[REDACTED]>
Cc: "jeffrey E." <jeevacation@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: quick question -- AGI-16 snacks and reception sponsorship?
Date: Fri, 15 Jul 2016 21:29:47 +0000

cool then... it's a date!

Jeffrey, is there any particular time that's best for you? I have nothing scheduled that day except for a dinner which is cancelable...

;) ben

On Fri, Jul 15, 2016 at 5:20 PM, Joscha Bach <[REDACTED]> wrote:
> yes!

>
>> Am 15.07.2016 um 16:36 schrieb Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>:

>>
>> Awesome! I am free anytime on the 21st... Joscha, can you stay around
>> the 21 as well?

>>
>>> On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 4:34 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:
>>> i can do the 21 anytime as well I with as many people as you like up to 10
>>>

>>>> On Fri, Jul 15, 2016 at 4:21 PM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>>
>>>> Hi Jeffrey,

>>>>
>>>> It will be great to meet up and talk!

>>>>
>>>> However, on the 20th I am co-organizing (and serving at emcee at) this
>>>> event at the New School... ("Future of Mind" workshop ...)

>>>>
>>>> <https://futureofmind.wordpress.com/>

>>>>
>>>> It ends at 6:15PM on the 20th ...

>>>>
>>>> We can meet in the evening on the 20th if you like (6:45PM would
>>>> work), or else maybe the 21st if you're available?

>>>>
>>>> With more advance notice I could have put this Future of Mind event on
>>>> the 21 so as to meet with you on the 20 ... but now we have 110 people
>>>> signed up for the event on the 20th ...

>>>>
>>>> thanks
>>>> Ben

>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>

>>>>> On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 3:17 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:

>>>>> i can do the afternoon of the 20th for anyone you guys think i should meet.

>>>>> and will stay around. if necessary i can pick up any aadditonal expenses incurred in doing so

>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:31 AM, Ben Goertzel [REDACTED] wrote:

>>>>> All good, thanks so much for the help!

>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 8:42 PM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:

>>>>> no jeffrey epstein . is enough

>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 12:36 AM, Ben Goertzel [REDACTED] wrote:

>>>>>> About the sponsorship -- should I list one of your organizations on the conference materials as a sponsor? If so which one? Enhanced Education again?

>>>>>> thx...

>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 10:36 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:

>>>>>> first paper is silly, it does not include rythm, only notes.

>>>>>> points but no temporal shape. sorry

>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 10:25 PM, Ben Goertzel [REDACTED] wrote:

>>>>>>> Hmmmm...

>>>>>>> I have been thinking a lot about music too, but from a different perspective...

>>>>>>> Do you know this paper on Combinatorial Music Theory?

>>>>>>> paper:
>>>>>>> <http://andrewduncan.net/cmt/>

>>>>>>> video:
>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OMDtp89Xqlw>

>>>>>>> It's extremely good, it clarifies some basics of music theory in a

>>>>>>> mathematical way without the confusing archaic terminology of standard

>>>>>>> music theory... and suggests various interesting new directions...

>>>>>>> This paper is also related and somewhat worthwhile

>>>>>>> https://www.math.washington.edu/~morrow/336_09/papers/Ada.pdf

>>>>>>>>> structure....
>>>>>>>>> I.e., we probably gotta solve folk music before we can solve
>>>>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>>>>> or Bartok ...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> Meyer's old theory of "surprising fulfillment of expectations"
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> <http://rhythmcoglab.coursepress.yale.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2014/10/Emotion-and-Meaning-in-Music.pdf>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> is basically correct IMO (if you don't know that book check it
>>>>>>>>> out,
>>>>>>>>> you'll love his classical music examples) ... but the subtle
>>>>>>>>> point
>>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>>> that the expectations and the surprise we experience are a subtle
>>>>>>>>> mix
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> -- basic mathematical music-structure factors, as in the vein of
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> two papers I linked above
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> -- human psychology factors as modeled e.g. in Joscha's work and
>>>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>>>> the Component Process Model (
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> http://boccignone.di.unimi.it/CompAff2015_files/Phil.%20Trans.%20R.%20Soc.%20B-2009-Scherer-3459-74.pdf
>>>>>>>>> which we have introduced into the OpenCog / Hanson Robot codebase
>>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>>> fill in certain gaps in Psi
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> -- human body-rhythm patterns, to do with the way the rhythms of
>>>>>>>>> different subsystems of our physical bodies overlay on each
>>>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>>>> which we perceive all the time sub and semi consciously and which
>>>>>>>>> influence our perception of music; obviously even classical music
>>>>>>>>> without a drumbeat is highly rhythmic...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> -- more abstract cognitive pattern recognition
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> So a good melody packs up "surprising fulfillment of
>>>>>>>>> expectations"
>>>>>>>>> where the expectation and fulfillment are assessed according to a
>>>>>>>>> combination of the above 4 factors ... and if you leave any of
>>>>>>>>> the

>>>>>>>>> above 4 factors out you're going to get lots of "false positives"
>>>>>>>>> ...
>>>>>>>>> All of the above factors are there in Chinese, African etc. music
>>>>>>>>> as
>>>>>>>>> well as Western music, but manifested in different ways...
>>>>>>>>> I can pretty clearly see how to seriously investigate the above
>>>>>>>>> but
>>>>>>>>> I
>>>>>>>>> can't at the moment see a "quick and dirty" way to make huge
>>>>>>>>> progress
>>>>>>>>> quickly ... while seemingly simple, the question of "what makes a
>>>>>>>>> melody appealing" actually wraps up a lot of issues ... BODY,
>>>>>>>>> EMOTION, COGNITION ... plus MATH-OF-MUSIC ...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> Fascinating stuff though ;)
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> If you want to design a research programme in this direction I'd
>>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>>> game to participate; I don't want to drop my other OpenCog R&D
>>>>>>>>> obviously but music just fascinates me at a heart as well as head
>>>>>>>>> level, so I'd be willing to put some time into this in parallel
>>>>>>>>> with
>>>>>>>>> making the Hanson robots work... I do have a feeling that to
>>>>>>>>> really
>>>>>>>>> crack the problem of what makes a melody sound good, one has to
>>>>>>>>> crack
>>>>>>>>> the problem of how feeling and body and cognition work together,
>>>>>>>>> which
>>>>>>>>> is a key problem for AGI generally speaking...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> -- Ben
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> P. S.
>>>>>>>>> Of course, complex development of themes and counter and sub
>>>>>>>>> themes
>>>>>>>>> and so forth is not exclusive to Western classical music.... For
>>>>>>>>> instance this 30 minute instrumental-rock song composed by
>>>>>>>>> Buckethead
>>>>>>>>> in memoriam for his mother has incredible subtlety of development
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E5PXYehriYY>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> ... so many themes introduced in the first half and then
>>>>>>>>> complexly,
>>>>>>>>> genetically crossed over and synergized in the second half.. It
>>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>>> my
>>>>>>>>> firm conviction that Buckethead will be remembered as the
>>>>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> the early 21st century ;) ...
>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> For me the ultimate is Prometheus, by Scriabin, though...

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5GEwho6Dbnc>

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> do you know it? Wow.... This is cognitive and emotional

>>>>>>>> development

>>>>>>>> beyond the ordinary human level, such as only a true genius

>>>>>>>> madman

>>>>>>>> could produce. I had an amazing mental experience in San

>>>>>>>> Francisco

>>>>>>>> in 2012 listening to Prometheus 10 times in succession ... try it

>>>>>>>> sometime...

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:39 AM, jeffrey E.

>>>>>>>> <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>> looking for AI and music. . a melody is a strange object,

>>>>>>>> it

>>>>>>>> is

>>>>>>>> an

>>>>>>>> inter

>>>>>>>> as well as intra relation with notes and time. . there are

>>>>>>>> inherent

>>>>>>>> harmonies. and dissonance. . what i wrote to chonsky this

>>>>>>>> morning

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> today I conducted an experiment encouraged by Noam's wholly

>>>>>>>> justified

>>>>>>>> aggressive and detailed directives to joscha. . joshcha

>>>>>>>> focused

>>>>>>>> on

>>>>>>>> layers

>>>>>>>> being developed in the brain . the timing for the development

>>>>>>>> of

>>>>>>>> each

>>>>>>>> layer

>>>>>>>> being different per species .

>>>>>>>> I postulate that music might be a frosted window into that

>>>>>>>> structure.

>>>>>>>> symphonies begin with their first " layer " a theme. in fact

>>>>>>>> ,

>>>>>>>> there

>>>>>>>> might be more than one theme in the first layer , , the second

>>>>>>>> part

>>>>>>>> of

>>>>>>>> symphonic form is the complex development stage. where

>>>>>>>> those

>>>>>>>> themes

>>>>>>>> are inverted, deconstructed , reconstructed etc ,and the

>>>>>>>> development

>>>>>>>> stage

>>>>>>>> takes the most time . in the conclusion of the symphonic

>>>>>>>>> form
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> recapitulation of all that has come before it forms a "
>>>>>>>>> phenenoma
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> piece " a whole ,made up of its smaller concepts . As
>>>>>>>>> opposed
>>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>>> listening to music to record which neuron is firing, as most
>>>>>>>>> musciologists
>>>>>>>>> attempt . I propose that the music may be the audible result
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> those
>>>>>>>>> neurons firing, made possible by a select few who would
>>>>>>>>> attempt
>>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>>> notate
>>>>>>>>> those neuronal firings. Beethoven for example.
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> The experiment . I mashed all of the four symphonies
>>>>>>>>> together
>>>>>>>>> ,
>>>>>>>>> playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlayed on
>>>>>>>>> each
>>>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>>>> playing at the same time. - the way a brain might develop. I
>>>>>>>>> expected
>>>>>>>>> an
>>>>>>>>> ordered noise but to the surprising contrary , IT WAS
>>>>>>>>> AMAZING.
>>>>>>>>> .
>>>>>>>>> you can hear new "concepts " forming,
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> il wonder whether in the mind of a blind child , the " music"
>>>>>>>>> would
>>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>>> created even without the visual referencial. but created none
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> less.
>>>>>>>>> later when the visual can be tied to concepts , the anatomy
>>>>>>>>> may
>>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>>> hijacked
>>>>>>>>> to produce sounds . that somehow relate to the concepts. .
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> I tried to mix music from different cultures- it didn't work.
>>>>>>>>> African
>>>>>>>>> does not work with western europe,- chinese works with neither
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> other
>>>>>>>>> two. but within the same cultural music (the brain of the
>>>>>>>>> local

>>>>>>>>>> species
>>>>>>>>>>) the mash ups are beautiful.
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> I would note that computers engage in "parallel processing"
>>>>>>>>>> only
>>>>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>>>>> order
>>>>>>>>>> to take a hard problem and break it into its component parts ,
>>>>>>>>>> working
>>>>>>>>>> on
>>>>>>>>>> each component separately, , here each problem Interacts
>>>>>>>>>> and
>>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>>> their
>>>>>>>>>> resolutions interact in remarkable ways.
>>>>>>>>>> --
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 9:37 PM, Ben Goertzel
>>>>>>>>>> [REDACTED]
>>>>>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> (i.e. being a "fiscal sponsor" for the HLAI/AGI conference is
>>>>>>>>>> within
>>>>>>>>>> Humanity+'s mandate as a 501(c)3, so there's no problem
>>>>>>>>>> here...)
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:36 AM, Ben Goertzel
>>>>>>>>>> [REDACTED]
>>>>>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>>>> We can route the donation through Humanity+, which is a
>>>>>>>>>> 501(c)3
>>>>>>>>>> ...
>>>>>>>>>> as
>>>>>>>>>> we have done with some of your previous donations for my
>>>>>>>>>> research...
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:33 AM, jeffrey E.
>>>>>>>>>> <jeevacation@gmail.com>
>>>>>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>>>> is it a 501 c 3
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 9:30 PM, Ben Goertzel
>>>>>>>>>> [REDACTED]
>>>>>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> Hey there,
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> Hope you're well...
>>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>> I'll send you another email about connecting this summer
>>>>>>>>>> while
>>>>>>>>>> I'm
>>>>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>>>>> the US if you'll be around...

>>>>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>>>>> please note

>>>>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of

>>>>>>>>>> JEE

>>>>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global
>>>>>>>>>> Brain

>>>>>>>>>> is

>>>>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>>>>> please note

>>>>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of

>>>>>>>>>> JEE

>>>>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain
>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> please note
>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>>>> JEE
>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> please note
>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>>>> JEE
>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>>>
>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>> currently struggling to form...
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>> please note
>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>> JEE
>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved
>>
>>
>>
>> --
>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>
>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>> currently struggling to form...

--
Ben Goertzel, PhD
<http://goertzel.org>

Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
currently struggling to form...