

From: Joscha Bach <[REDACTED]>
To: Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>
Cc: "jeffrey E." <jeevacation@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: quick question -- AGI-16 snacks and reception sponsorship?
Date: Fri, 15 Jul 2016 21:20:20 +0000

yes!

> Am 15.07.2016 um 16:36 schrieb Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>

>

> Awesome! I am free anytime on the 21st... Joscha, can you stay around
> the 21 as well?

>

>> On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 4:34 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:
>> i can do the 21 anytime as well I with as many people as you like up to 10

>>

>>> On Fri, Jul 15, 2016 at 4:21 PM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>

>>> Hi Jeffrey,

>>>

>>> It will be great to meet up and talk!

>>>

>>> However, on the 20th I am co-organizing (and serving at emcee at) this
>>> event at the New School... ("Future of Mind" workshop ...)

>>>

>>> <https://futureofmind.wordpress.com/>

>>>

>>> It ends at 6:15PM on the 20th ...

>>>

>>> We can meet in the evening on the 20th if you like (6:45PM would
>>> work), or else maybe the 21st if you're available?

>>>

>>> With more advance notice I could have put this Future of Mind event on
>>> the 21 so as to meet with you on the 20 ... but now we have 110 people
>>> signed up for the event on the 20th ...

>>>

>>> thanks

>>> Ben

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>> On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 3:17 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:

>>>> i can do the afternoon of the 20th for anyone you guys think i should
>>>> meet.

>>>> and will stay around. if necessary i can pick up any aadditonal
>>>> expenses incurred in doing so

>>>>

>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:31 AM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>>>

>>>>> All good, thanks so much for the help!

>>>>>

>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 8:42 PM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>> no jeffrey epstein . is enough

>>>>>>

>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 12:36 AM, Ben Goertzel

>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> About the sponsorship -- should I list one of your organizations on

>>>>>>> the conference materials as a sponsor? If so which one? Enhanced

>>>>>>> Education again?

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> thx...

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 10:36 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>> first paper is silly, it does not include rythm, only notes.

>>>>>>>> points

>>>>>>>> but no temporal shape. sorry

>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 10:25 PM, Ben Goertzel

>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> Hmm...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> I have been thinking a lot about music too, but from a different

>>>>>>>>> perspective...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> Do you know this paper on Combinatorial Music Theory?

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> paper:

>>>>>>>>> <http://andrewduncan.net/cmt/>

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> video:

>>>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OMDtp89Xqlw>

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> It's extremely good, it clarifies some basics of music theory in

>>>>>>>>> a

>>>>>>>>> mathematical way without the confusing archaic terminology of

>>>>>>>>> standard

>>>>>>>>> music theory... and suggests various interesting new

>>>>>>>>> directions...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> This paper is also related and somewhat worthwhile

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> https://www.math.washington.edu/~morrow/336_09/papers/Ada.pdf

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> though neither as easy-to-read nor as interesting...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> What these papers are getting as are the hidden

>>>>>>>>> abstract-algebraic

>>>>>>>>> and

>>>>>>>>> information-theoretic structures underlying melody and harmony...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>> What you're talking about regarding symphonies is sort of like
>>>>>>>> "narrative structure" in stories it seems like -- or "discourse
>>>>>>>> planning" in dialogue -- i.e. it's higher-level
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> That level is important, for sure. But what the papers I've
>>>>>>>> linked
>>>>>>>> above are getting at is a bit lower-level --- more analogous to
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> syntax and phrase/sentence level semantics of language, I would
>>>>>>>> say.
>>>>>>>> The algebra and information theory of melody and harmony have to
>>>>>>>> work
>>>>>>>> out at the level of individual chords and melodic passages, for
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> higher-level development of a symphony or other complex work to
>>>>>>>> make
>>>>>>>> sense...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> About
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> I mashed all of the four symphonies together ,
>>>>>>>> playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlayed on
>>>>>>>> each
>>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> I have done stuff like that before, but not with classical
>>>>>>>> music...
>>>>>>>> with my own recordings ;) Do you have a sound file of your
>>>>>>>> experiment? I'd be curious to hear...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> Interestingly, the "plumbing" work we've been doing to connect
>>>>>>>> OpenCog
>>>>>>>> to the Hanson robots would also enable us to use OpenCog for
>>>>>>>> music
>>>>>>>> composition / improvisation experimentation ... (i.e. we've been
>>>>>>>> dealing with real-time input and output, which we hadn't been
>>>>>>>> doing
>>>>>>>> before)
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> But at the moment (this opinion is of course subject to revision)
>>>>>>>> I
>>>>>>>> somewhat feel that the basic problem of "what makes a melody
>>>>>>>> /harmony
>>>>>>>> / rhythm pattern sound emotionally and cognitively appealing" has
>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>> be solved before one moves on to issues of symphonic
>>>>>>>> structure....
>>>>>>>> I.e., we probably gotta solve folk music before we can solve
>>>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>>>> or Bartok ...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> Meyer's old theory of "surprising fulfillment of expectations"
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> <http://rhythmcoglab.coursepress.yale.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2014/10/Emotion-and-Meaning-in-Music.pdf>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> is basically correct IMO (if you don't know that book check it
>>>>>>>> out,
>>>>>>>> you'll love his classical music examples) ... but the subtle
>>>>>>>> point
>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>> that the expectations and the surprise we experience are a subtle
>>>>>>>> mix
>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> -- basic mathematical music-structure factors, as in the vein of
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> two papers I linked above
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> -- human psychology factors as modeled e.g. in Joscha's work and
>>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>>> the Component Process Model (
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> http://boccignone.di.unimi.it/CompAff2015_files/Phil.%20Trans.%20R.%20Soc.%20B-2009-Scherer-3459-74.pdf
>>>>>>>> which we have introduced into the OpenCog / Hanson Robot codebase
>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>> fill in certain gaps in Psi
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> -- human body-rhythm patterns, to do with the way the rhythms of
>>>>>>>> different subsystems of our physical bodies overlay on each
>>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>>> which we perceive all the time sub and semi consciously and which
>>>>>>>> influence our perception of music; obviously even classical music
>>>>>>>> without a drumbeat is highly rhythmic...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> -- more abstract cognitive pattern recognition
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> So a good melody packs up "surprising fulfillment of
>>>>>>>> expectations"
>>>>>>>> where the expectation and fulfillment are assessed according to a
>>>>>>>> combination of the above 4 factors ... and if you leave any of
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> above 4 factors out you're going to get lots of "false positives"
>>>>>>>> ...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> All of the above factors are there in Chinese, African etc. music
>>>>>>>> as
>>>>>>>> well as Western music, but manifested in different ways...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> I can pretty clearly see how to seriously investigate the above

>>>>>>>> but
>>>>>>>> I
>>>>>>>> can't at the moment see a "quick and dirty" way to make huge
>>>>>>>> progress
>>>>>>>> quickly ... while seemingly simple, the question of "what makes a
>>>>>>>> melody appealing" actually wraps up a lot of issues ... BODY,
>>>>>>>> EMOTION, COGNITION ... plus MATH-OF-MUSIC ...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> Fascinating stuff though ;)
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> If you want to design a research programme in this direction I'd
>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>> game to participate; I don't want to drop my other OpenCog R&D
>>>>>>>> obviously but music just fascinates me at a heart as well as head
>>>>>>>> level, so I'd be willing to put some time into this in parallel
>>>>>>>> with
>>>>>>>> making the Hanson robots work... I do have a feeling that to
>>>>>>>> really
>>>>>>>> crack the problem of what makes a melody sound good, one has to
>>>>>>>> crack
>>>>>>>> the problem of how feeling and body and cognition work together,
>>>>>>>> which
>>>>>>>> is a key problem for AGI generally speaking...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> -- Ben
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> P. S.
>>>>>>>> Of course, complex development of themes and counter and sub
>>>>>>>> themes
>>>>>>>> and so forth is not exclusive to Western classical music.... For
>>>>>>>> instance this 30 minute instrumental-rock song composed by
>>>>>>>> Buckethead
>>>>>>>> in memoriam for his mother has incredible subtlety of development
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E5PXYehriYY>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> ... so many themes introduced in the first half and then
>>>>>>>> complexly,
>>>>>>>> genetically crossed over and synergized in the second half.. It
>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>> my
>>>>>>>> firm conviction that Buckethead will be remembered as the
>>>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>> the early 21st century ;) ...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> For me the ultimate is Prometheus, by Scriabin, though...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5GEwho6Dbnc>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> do you know it? Wow.... This is cognitive and emotional
>>>>>>>> development
>>>>>>>> beyond the ordinary human level, such as only a true genius
>>>>>>>> madman

>>>>>>>> could produce. I had an amazing mental experience in San
>>>>>>>> Francisco
>>>>>>>> in 2012 listening to Prometheus 10 times in succession ... try it
>>>>>>>> sometime...
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:39 AM, jeffrey E.
>>>>>>>> <jeevacation@gmail.com>
>>>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>> looking for AI and music. . a melody is a strange object,
>>>>>>>> it
>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>> an
>>>>>>>> inter
>>>>>>>> as well as intra relation with notes and time. . there are
>>>>>>>> inherent
>>>>>>>> harmonies. and dissonance. . what i wrote to chonsky this
>>>>>>>> moring
>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>> today I conducted an experiment encouraged by Noam's wholly
>>>>>>>> justified
>>>>>>>> aggressive and detailed directives to joscha. . joshcha
>>>>>>>> focused
>>>>>>>> on
>>>>>>>> layers
>>>>>>>> being developed in the brain . the timing for the development
>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>> each
>>>>>>>> layer
>>>>>>>> being different per species .
>>>>>>>> I postulate that music might be a frosted window into that
>>>>>>>> structure.
>>>>>>>> symphonies begin with their first " layer " a theme. in fact
>>>>>>>> ,
>>>>>>>> there
>>>>>>>> might be more than one theme in the first layer , , the second
>>>>>>>> part
>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>> symphonic form is the complex development stage. where
>>>>>>>> those
>>>>>>>> themes
>>>>>>>> are inverted, deconstructed , reconstructed etc ,and the
>>>>>>>> development
>>>>>>>> stage
>>>>>>>> takes the most time . in the conclusion of the symphonic
>>>>>>>> form
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> recapitulation of all that has come before it forms a "
>>>>>>>> phenenoma
>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>> piece " a whole ,made up of its smaller concepts . As
>>>>>>>> opposed

>>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>>> listening to music to record which neuron is firing, as most
>>>>>>>>> musciologists
>>>>>>>>> attempt . I propose that the music may be the audible result
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> those
>>>>>>>>> neurons firing, made possible by a select few who would
>>>>>>>>> attempt
>>>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>>>> notate
>>>>>>>>> those neuronal firings. Beethoven for example.
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> The experiment . I mashed all of the four symphonies
>>>>>>>>> together
>>>>>>>>> ,
>>>>>>>>> playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlaid on
>>>>>>>>> each
>>>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>>>> playing at the same time. - the way a brain might develop. I
>>>>>>>>> expected
>>>>>>>>> an
>>>>>>>>> ordered noise but to the surprising contrary , IT WAS
>>>>>>>>> AMAZING.
>>>>>>>>> .
>>>>>>>>> you can hear new "concepts " forming,
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> il wonder whether in the mind of a blind child , the " music"
>>>>>>>>> would
>>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>>> created even without the visual referencial. but created none
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> less.
>>>>>>>>> later when the visual can be tied to concepts , the anatomy
>>>>>>>>> may
>>>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>>>> hijacked
>>>>>>>>> to produce sounds . that somehow relate to the concepts. .
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> I tried to mix music from different cultures- it didn't work.
>>>>>>>>> African
>>>>>>>>> does not work with western europe,- chinese works with neither
>>>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>>>> other
>>>>>>>>> two. but within the same cultural music (the brain of the
>>>>>>>>> local
>>>>>>>>> species
>>>>>>>>>) the mash ups are beautiful.
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> I would note that computers engage in "parallel processing"
>>>>>>>>> only
>>>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>>>> order
>>>>>>>>> to take a hard problem and break it into its component parts ,

>>>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>>>>>> JEE
>>>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> --
>>>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>>>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global
>>>>>>>>> Brain
>>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> --
>>>>>>>>> please note
>>>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>>>>>> JEE
>>>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> --
>>>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>>>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain
>>>>>>>>> is
>>>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>>>

>>>>> --

>>>>> please note

>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>> JEE

>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> --

>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>

>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> --

>>>>> please note

>>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>>> JEE

>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> --

>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>

>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>>

>> --
>> please note
>> The information contained in this communication is
>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>> JEE
>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>

>

>

> --

> Ben Goertzel, PhD

> <http://goertzel.org>

>

> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is

> currently struggling to form...