

From: Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>
To: "jeffrey E." <jeevacation@gmail.com>, Joscha Bach <[REDACTED]>
Subject: Re: quick question -- AGI-16 snacks and reception sponsorship?
Date: Fri, 15 Jul 2016 20:36:59 +0000

Awesome! I am free anytime on the 21st... Joscha, can you stay around the 21 as well?

On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 4:34 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:
> i can do the 21 anytime as well l with as many people as you like up to 10

>
> On Fri, Jul 15, 2016 at 4:21 PM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>
>> Hi Jeffrey,

>>
>> It will be great to meet up and talk!

>>
>> However, on the 20th I am co-organizing (and serving at emcee at) this
>> event at the New School... ("Future of Mind" workshop ...)

>>
>> <https://futureofmind.wordpress.com/>

>>
>> It ends at 6:15PM on the 20th ...

>>
>> We can meet in the evening on the 20th if you like (6:45PM would
>> work), or else maybe the 21st if you're available?

>>
>> With more advance notice I could have put this Future of Mind event on
>> the 21 so as to meet with you on the 20 ... but now we have 110 people
>> signed up for the event on the 20th ...

>>
>> thanks
>> Ben

>>
>>
>>
>>
>> On Sat, Jul 16, 2016 at 3:17 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com> wrote:

>>> i can do the afternoon of the 20th for anyone you guys think i should
>>> meet.

>>> and will stay around. if necessary i can pick up any aadditonal
>>> expenses incurred in doing so

>>>
>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:31 AM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>>
>>>> All good, thanks so much for the help!

>>>>
>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 8:42 PM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>> wrote:
>>>>> no jeffrey epstein . is enough

>>>>>

>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 12:36 AM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>
>>>> wrote:
>>>>>
>>>>> About the sponsorship -- should I list one of your organizations on
>>>>> the conference materials as a sponsor? If so which one? Enhanced
>>>>> Education again?
>>>>>
>>>>> thx...
>>>>>
>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 10:36 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com>
>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>> first paper is silly, it does not include rythm, only notes.
>>>>>> points
>>>>>> but no temporal shape. sorry
>>>>>>
>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 10:25 PM, Ben Goertzel <[REDACTED]>
>>>>>> wrote:
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> Hmm...
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> I have been thinking a lot about music too, but from a different
>>>>>>> perspective...
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> Do you know this paper on Combinatorial Music Theory?
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> paper:
>>>>>>> <http://andrewduncan.net/cmt/>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> video:
>>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OMDtp89Xqlw>
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> It's extremely good, it clarifies some basics of music theory in
>>>>>>> a
>>>>>>> mathematical way without the confusing archaic terminology of
>>>>>>> standard
>>>>>>> music theory... and suggests various interesting new
>>>>>>> directions...
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> This paper is also related and somewhat worthwhile
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> https://www.math.washington.edu/~morrow/336_09/papers/Ada.pdf
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> though neither as easy-to-read nor as interesting...
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> What these papers are getting as are the hidden
>>>>>>> abstract-algebraic
>>>>>>> and
>>>>>>> information-theoretic structures underlying melody and harmony...
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> What you're talking about regarding symphonies is sort of like
>>>>>>> "narrative structure" in stories it seems like -- or "discourse
>>>>>>> planning" in dialogue -- i.e. it's higher-level
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> That level is important, for sure. But what the papers I've

>>>>> linked
>>>>> above are getting at is a bit lower-level --- more analogous to
>>>>> the
>>>>> syntax and phrase/sentence level semantics of language, I would
>>>>> say.
>>>>> The algebra and information theory of melody and harmony have to
>>>>> work
>>>>> out at the level of individual chords and melodic passages, for
>>>>> the
>>>>> higher-level development of a symphony or other complex work to
>>>>> make
>>>>> sense...
>>>>>
>>>>> About
>>>>>
>>>>>> I mashed all of the four symphonies together ,
>>>>>> playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlaid on
>>>>>> each
>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>
>>>>>> I have done stuff like that before, but not with classical
>>>>>> music...
>>>>>> with my own recordings ;) Do you have a sound file of your
>>>>>> experiment? I'd be curious to hear...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> Interestingly, the "plumbing" work we've been doing to connect
>>>>>> OpenCog
>>>>>> to the Hanson robots would also enable us to use OpenCog for
>>>>>> music
>>>>>> composition / improvisation experimentation ... (i.e. we've been
>>>>>> dealing with real-time input and output, which we hadn't been
>>>>>> doing
>>>>>> before)
>>>>>>
>>>>>> But at the moment (this opinion is of course subject to revision)
>>>>>> I
>>>>>> somewhat feel that the basic problem of "what makes a melody
>>>>>> /harmony
>>>>>> / rhythm pattern sound emotionally and cognitively appealing" has
>>>>>> to
>>>>>> be solved before one moves on to issues of symphonic
>>>>>> structure....
>>>>>> I.e., we probably gotta solve folk music before we can solve
>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>> or Bartok ...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> Meyer's old theory of "surprising fulfillment of expectations"
>>>>>>
>>>>>>
>>>>>>
>>>>>>
>>>>>> <http://rhythmcoglab.coursepress.yale.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2014/10/Emotion-and-Meaning-in-Music.pdf>

>>>>>>
>>>>>> is basically correct IMO (if you don't know that book check it
>>>>>> out,
>>>>>> you'll love his classical music examples) ... but the subtle
>>>>>> point
>>>>>> is
>>>>>> that the expectations and the surprise we experience are a subtle
>>>>>> mix
>>>>>> of
>>>>>>
>>>>>> -- basic mathematical music-structure factors, as in the vein of
>>>>>> the
>>>>>> two papers I linked above
>>>>>>
>>>>>> -- human psychology factors as modeled e.g. in Joscha's work and
>>>>>> in
>>>>>> the Component Process Model (
>>>>>>
>>>>>>
>>>>>>
>>>>>> http://boccignone.di.unimi.it/CompAff2015_files/Phil.%20Trans.%20R.%20Soc.%20B-2009-Scherer-3459-74.pdf)
>>>>>> which we have introduced into the OpenCog / Hanson Robot codebase
>>>>>> to
>>>>>> fill in certain gaps in Psi
>>>>>>
>>>>>> -- human body-rhythm patterns, to do with the way the rhythms of
>>>>>> different subsystems of our physical bodies overlay on each
>>>>>> other,
>>>>>> which we perceive all the time sub and semi consciously and which
>>>>>> influence our perception of music; obviously even classical music
>>>>>> without a drumbeat is highly rhythmic...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> -- more abstract cognitive pattern recognition
>>>>>>
>>>>>> So a good melody packs up "surprising fulfillment of
>>>>>> expectations"
>>>>>> where the expectation and fulfillment are assessed according to a
>>>>>> combination of the above 4 factors ... and if you leave any of
>>>>>> the
>>>>>> above 4 factors out you're going to get lots of "false positives"
>>>>>> ...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> All of the above factors are there in Chinese, African etc. music
>>>>>> as
>>>>>> well as Western music, but manifested in different ways...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> I can pretty clearly see how to seriously investigate the above
>>>>>> but
>>>>>> I
>>>>>> can't at the moment see a "quick and dirty" way to make huge
>>>>>> progress
>>>>>> quickly ... while seemingly simple, the question of "what makes a

>>>>>> melody appealing" actually wraps up a lot of issues ... BODY,
>>>>>> EMOTION, COGNITION ... plus MATH-OF-MUSIC ...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> Fascinating stuff though ;)
>>>>>>
>>>>>> If you want to design a research programme in this direction I'd
>>>>>> be
>>>>>> game to participate; I don't want to drop my other OpenCog R&D
>>>>>> obviously but music just fascinates me at a heart as well as head
>>>>>> level, so I'd be willing to put some time into this in parallel
>>>>>> with
>>>>>> making the Hanson robots work... I do have a feeling that to
>>>>>> really
>>>>>> crack the problem of what makes a melody sound good, one has to
>>>>>> crack
>>>>>> the problem of how feeling and body and cognition work together,
>>>>>> which
>>>>>> is a key problem for AGI generally speaking...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> -- Ben
>>>>>>
>>>>>> P. S.
>>>>>> Of course, complex development of themes and counter and sub
>>>>>> themes
>>>>>> and so forth is not exclusive to Western classical music.... For
>>>>>> instance this 30 minute instrumental-rock song composed by
>>>>>> Buckethead
>>>>>> in memoriam for his mother has incredible subtlety of development
>>>>>>
>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E5PXYehriYY>
>>>>>>
>>>>>> ... so many themes introduced in the first half and then
>>>>>> complexly,
>>>>>> genetically crossed over and synergized in the second half.. It
>>>>>> is
>>>>>> my
>>>>>> firm conviction that Buckethead will be remembered as the
>>>>>> Beethoven
>>>>>> of
>>>>>> the early 21st century ;) ...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> For me the ultimate is Prometheus, by Scriabin, though...
>>>>>>
>>>>>> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5GEwho6Dbnc>
>>>>>>
>>>>>> do you know it? Wow.... This is cognitive and emotional
>>>>>> development
>>>>>> beyond the ordinary human level, such as only a true genius
>>>>>> madman
>>>>>> could produce. I had an amazing mental experience in San
>>>>>> Francisco
>>>>>> in 2012 listening to Prometheus 10 times in succession ... try it
>>>>>> sometime...
>>>>>>

>>>>>>
>>>>>>

>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:39 AM, jeffrey E.

>>>>>> <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>> > looking for AI and music. . a melody is a strange object,

>>>>>> > it

>>>>>> > is

>>>>>> > an

>>>>>> > inter

>>>>>> > as well as intra relation with notes and time. . there are

>>>>>> > inherent

>>>>>> > harmonies. and dissonance. . what i wrote to chonsky this

>>>>>> > moring

>>>>>> >

>>>>>> > today I conducted an experiment encouraged by Noam's wholly

>>>>>> > justified

>>>>>> > aggressive and detailed directives to joscha. . joshcha

>>>>>> > focused

>>>>>> > on

>>>>>> > layers

>>>>>> > being developed in the brain . the timing for the development

>>>>>> > of

>>>>>> > each

>>>>>> > layer

>>>>>> > being different per species .

>>>>>> > I postulate that music might be a frosted window into that

>>>>>> > structure.

>>>>>> > symphonies begin with their first " layer " a theme. in fact

>>>>>> > ,

>>>>>> > there

>>>>>> > might be more than one theme in the first layer , , the second

>>>>>> > part

>>>>>> > of

>>>>>> > symphonic form is the complex development stage. where

>>>>>> > those

>>>>>> > themes

>>>>>> > are inverted, deconstructed , reconstructed etc ,and the

>>>>>> > development

>>>>>> > stage

>>>>>> > takes the most time . in the conclusion of the symphonic

>>>>>> > form

>>>>>> > the

>>>>>> > recapitulation of all that has come before it forms a "

>>>>>> > phenenoma

>>>>>> > of

>>>>>> > the

>>>>>> > piece " a whole ,made up of its smaller concepts . As

>>>>>> > opposed

>>>>>> > to

>>>>>> > listening to music to record which neuron is firing, as most

>>>>>> > musciolgists

>>>>>> > attempt . I propose that the music may be the audible result

>>>>>> > of

>>>>>>> those
>>>>>>> neurons firing, made possible by a select few who would
>>>>>>> attempt
>>>>>>> to
>>>>>>> notate
>>>>>>> those neuronal firings. Beethoven for example.
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> The experiment . I mashed all of the four symphonies
>>>>>>> together
>>>>>>> ,
>>>>>>> playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlaid on
>>>>>>> each
>>>>>>> other,
>>>>>>> playing at the same time. - the way a brain might develop. I
>>>>>>> expected
>>>>>>> an
>>>>>>> ordered noise but to the surprising contrary , IT WAS
>>>>>>> AMAZING.
>>>>>>> .
>>>>>>> you can hear new "concepts " forming,
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> il wonder whether in the mind of a blind child , the " music"
>>>>>>> would
>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>> created even without the visual referencial. but created none
>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>> less.
>>>>>>> later when the visual can be tied to concepts , the anatomy
>>>>>>> may
>>>>>>> be
>>>>>>> hijacked
>>>>>>> to produce sounds . that somehow relate to the concepts. .
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> I tried to mix music from different cultures- it didn't work.
>>>>>>> African
>>>>>>> does not work with western europe,- chinese works with neither
>>>>>>> of
>>>>>>> the
>>>>>>> other
>>>>>>> two. but within the same cultural music (the brain of the
>>>>>>> local
>>>>>>> species
>>>>>>>) the mash ups are beautiful.
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>> I would note that computers engage in "parallel processing"
>>>>>>> only
>>>>>>> in
>>>>>>> order
>>>>>>> to take a hard problem and break it into its component parts ,
>>>>>>> working
>>>>>>> on
>>>>>>> each component separately, , here each problem Interacts
>>>>>>> and
>>>>>>> the

>>>>>>>>> their
>>>>>>>>> resolutions interact in remarkable ways.

>>>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 9:37 PM, Ben Goertzel

>>>>>>>>> [REDACTED]

>>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> (i.e. being a "fiscal sponsor" for the HLAI/AGI conference is

>>>>>>>>> within

>>>>>>>>> Humanity+'s mandate as a 501(c)3, so there's no problem

>>>>>>>>> here...)

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:36 AM, Ben Goertzel

>>>>>>>>> <ben@goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>>> We can route the donation through Humanity+, which is a

>>>>>>>>> 501(c)3

>>>>>>>>> ...

>>>>>>>>> as

>>>>>>>>> we have done with some of your previous donations for my

>>>>>>>>> research...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> On Mon, Jul 11, 2016 at 9:33 AM, jeffrey E.

>>>>>>>>> <jeevacation@gmail.com>

>>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>>> is it a 501 c 3

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 9:30 PM, Ben Goertzel

>>>>>>>>> [REDACTED]

>>>>>>>>> wrote:

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> Hey there,

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> Hope you're well...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> I'll send you another email about connecting this summer

>>>>>>>>> while

>>>>>>>>> I'm

>>>>>>>>> in

>>>>>>>>> the US if you'll be around...

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> This email pertains to the AGI-16 / Human-Level AI

>>>>>>>>> conference

>>>>>>>>> which

>>>>>>>>> occurs upcoming week in New York (July 16-19).... at the

>>>>>>>>> New

>>>>>>>>> School.

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> We are doing the last-minute nitty-gritty conference

>>>>>>>>> planning

>>>>>>>>> and

>>>>>>>>> find

>>>>>>>>> ourselves short on cash for snacks and for drinks at the

>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global

>>>>>>> Brain

>>>>>>> is

>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> please note

>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is

>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may

>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for

>>>>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of

>>>>>>> JEE

>>>>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this

>>>>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited

>>>>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this

>>>>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by

>>>>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and

>>>>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,

>>>>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD

>>>>>>> <http://goertzel.org>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain

>>>>>>> is

>>>>>>> currently struggling to form...

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>> --

>>>>>>> please note

>>>>>>> The information contained in this communication is

>>>>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may

>>>>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for

>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>> JEE
>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>>>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>>>
>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>> currently struggling to form...
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>>> please note
>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for
>>>> the use of the addressee. It is the property of
>>>> JEE
>>>> Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
>>>> communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
>>>> and may be unlawful. If you have received this
>>>> communication in error, please notify us immediately by
>>>> return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
>>>> destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
>>>> including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>>> Ben Goertzel, PhD
>>>> <http://goertzel.org>
>>>>
>>>> Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is
>>>> currently struggling to form...
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>>> please note
>>>> The information contained in this communication is
>>>> confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may
>>>> constitute inside information, and is intended only for

- > the use of the addressee. It is the property of
- > JEE
- > Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this
- > communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited
- > and may be unlawful. If you have received this
- > communication in error, please notify us immediately by
- > return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com, and
- > destroy this communication and all copies thereof,
- > including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--

Ben Goertzel, PhD
<http://goertzel.org>

Super-benevolent super-intelligence is the thought the Global Brain is currently struggling to form...