

**From:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**To:** "jeffrey E." <jeevacation@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** Fwd: FW: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children  
**Date:** Mon, 26 Nov 2018 18:25:05 +0000  
**Attachments:** Noam\_Chomsky\_gift\_projected\_value\_worksheet\_November\_2018.xlsx

---

FYI

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
**Date:** Mon, Nov 26, 2018 at 8:02 AM  
**Subject:** FW: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children  
**To:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>, Valeria Chomsky <[REDACTED]>

Can we do a call today? Do these estimates look right to you?

Vincent J. Pisegna

Krokidas & Bluestein LLP

600 Atlantic Avenue

Boston, MA 02210

Te [REDACTED]  
Fa [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Anthony Arnove <[REDACTED]>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 26, 2018 9:37 AM  
**To:** Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
**Cc:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>; Valeria Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Subject:** Re: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children

Please find my estimated future earnings worksheet attached, Vincent

I used conservative estimates.

The numbers would be higher if, for example, Noam were to update any of these editions for an anniversary, or with a new preface. Or should an unexpected event occur, such as a book being cited prominently in a movie or TV show.

Please let me know if I can help with anything else.

Best  
Anthony

> On Nov 16, 2018, at 9:45 AM, Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>

> I believe the way to approach the issue is as follows: You cannot know precisely what will be received in the future but there are many instances in the law where estimates are acceptable. For example, when a business seeks lost profits or an injured individual seeks compensation for lost earning capacity the law allows experts to make reasonable assumptions to calculate an estimated damages number. I realize you are not an expert but here's where I think you can help. Make some reasonable estimate of how long each work will continue to generate revenues and then make an estimate of what the gross receipts will be over that period of time. Make your best estimate which will not be perfect. We can set up a call if you want to chat. We appreciate your help on this.

>

> Vincent J. Pisegna  
> Krokidas & Bluestein LLP  
> 600 Atlantic Avenue  
> Boston, MA 02210  
> Tel: [REDACTED]  
> Fax: [REDACTED]  
> [REDACTED]  
> [REDACTED]  
>

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Anthony Armove <[REDACTED]>  
> Sent: Thursday, November 15, 2018 7:00 PM  
> To: Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
> Cc: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>; Valeria Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
> Subject: Re: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children

>

> Hi Vincent, I would be happy to try. Do you want to give me a timeframe to project? The next year, five years, decade, life of copyright?

>

>> On Nov 14, 2018, at 5:11 PM, Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>

>> Anthony - can you give me some idea of future royalties to be paid on these assets? Again, mathematical precision is not required (or even possible on this question). Thanks.

>>

>> Vincent J. Pisegna  
>> Krokidas & Bluestein LLP  
>> 600 Atlantic Avenue  
>> Boston, MA 02210  
>> Tel: [REDACTED]  
>> Fax: [REDACTED]  
>> [REDACTED]  
>> [REDACTED]  
>>

>>

>>

>>

>> From: Anthony Armove <[REDACTED]>  
>> Sent: Monday, November 12, 2018 12:15 PM  
>> To: Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
>> Cc: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>; Valeria Chomsky

>> <[REDACTED]>

>> Subject: Re: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children

>>

>> Glad this helps, Vincent.

>>

>> I should flag that for

>>

>> On Language

>>

>> The children receive 19% each, as there are other beneficiaries.

>>

>> So the original sum I listed of \$28,927 should actually be netted down from the gross number I listed.

>>

>> I have attached a revised worksheet with that lower net gift calculation.

>>

>> best

>> Anthony

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>> On Nov 12, 2018, at 12:07 PM, Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>

>>> Thanks Anthony. I think I get the gist of it. I'll circle back with Noam for any questions I may have. Again, thanks for your help.

>>>

>>> Vincent J. Pisegna

>>> Krokidas & Bluestein LLP

>>> 600 Atlantic Avenue

>>> Boston, MA 02210

>>> Tel: [REDACTED]

>>> Fax [REDACTED]

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>> From: Anthony Armove <[REDACTED]>

>>> Sent: Saturday, November 10, 2018 9:49 AM

>>> To: Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>

>>> Cc: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>; Valeria Chomsky

>>> <[REDACTED]>

>>> Subject: Re: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children

>>>

>>> Dear Vincent,

>>>

>>> Please find attached an updated worksheet, showing the royalty income donated to Noam's children.

>>>

>>> These are conservative estimates, as I do not have complete records for every title, especially older titles.

>>>

>>> If I can help with anything else, please let me know.

>>>

>>> Best

>>> Anthony

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>> On Oct 24, 2018, at 1:58 PM, Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]> wrote:

>>>>

>>>> Thank you.

>>>>  
>>>> -----Original Message-----  
>>>> From: Anthony Arnov <[REDACTED]>  
>>>> Sent: Wednesday, October 24, 2018 1:48 PM  
>>>> To: Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
>>>> Cc: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
>>>> Subject: Re: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children  
>>>>  
>>>> Understood, Vincent. I can get to work on this.  
>>>>  
>>>>> On Oct 22, 2018, at 4:14 PM, Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]> wrote:  
>>>>>  
>>>>>> Thank you, Anthony. I really need some numbers, even if it is order of magnitude. There is no rush; we may be in mediation in a few weeks. It sounds like I will not need you to deal with publishers if you can give me reasonable order of magnitude numbers. For example, for Imperial Ambitions received approximately \$750,000 in royalties to date with the work still in circulation.  
>>>>>>  
>>>>>>> Vincent J. Pisegna  
>>>>>>> Krokidas & Bluestein LLP  
>>>>>>> 600 Atlantic Avenue  
>>>>>>> Boston, MA 02210  
>>>>>>> Tel: [REDACTED]  
>>>>>>> Fax [REDACTED]  
>>>>>>> [REDACTED]  
>>>>>>> [REDACTED]  
>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>

>>>>> -----Original Message-----  
>>>>> From: Anthony Arnov <[REDACTED]>  
>>>>> Sent: Friday, October 19, 2018 1:50 PM  
>>>>> To: Vincent Pisegna <[REDACTED]>  
>>>>> Subject: Evaluating Noam's gifts to his children  
>>>>>  
>>>>>> Dear Vincent,  
>>>>>>  
>>>>>>> I have summarized the the information I have access to below regarding Noam's gifts to his children.  
>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>> In brief, and to the best of my knowledge, the copyright gifts he's made in the form of assigning copyright and royalties are:  
>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>> \*  
>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>> AVIVA CHOMKSY  
>>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>>> Imperial Ambitions (shared with David Barsamian) Language and  
>>>>>>>>>> Mind Third edition New Military Humanism On Nature and Language  
>>>>>>>>>> Power Systems What We Say Goes  
>>>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>>>> DIANE CHOMSKY / DIANE CHOMSKY REVOCABLE TRUST / DIANE CHOMSKY  
>>>>>>>>>>> 2009 TRUST  
>>>>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>>>>> Chomsky on Mis-Education  
>>>>>>>>>>>> Language and Mind (Into the Classroom edition) Minimalist Program  
>>>>>>>>>>>> Missing Links software package Myth of Liberal Media VHS and DVD  
>>>>>>>>>>>> New Horizons in the Study of Language and Mind Powers and  
>>>>>>>>>>>> Prospects Profit Over People Rogue States  
>>>>>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>>>>>> HARRY CHOMSKY  
>>>>>>>>>>>>>> none individually  
>>>>>>>>>>>>>>  
>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> CHOMSKY GRANDCHILDREN NOMINEE TRUST  
>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>> Failed States

>>>>>

>>>>> AVIVA CHOMSKY, DIANE CHOMSKY, HARRY CHOMSKY (in equal thirds)

>>>>>

>>>>> Hegemony or Survival

>>>>> Rules and Representations

>>>>> On Language (19% each)

>>>>>

>>>>> CHOMSKY CHILDREN'S TRUST #2

>>>>>

>>>>> Reflections on Language

>>>>> Towards a New Cold War

>>>>>

>>>>> \*

>>>>>

>>>>> To be clear, I do not have access to current and historical data on all of these, but below is the data I do have ready to hand.

>>>>>

>>>>> You will see that only two of them include cumulative dollar

>>>>> amounts (and those are small),

>>>>>

>>>>> In reality, to get you accurate dollar amounts, especially for the larger titles, i would have to ask the publishers, which will take some time.

>>>>>

>>>>> In some cases, I could do my own reconstruction of the cumulative earnings based on the reporting I have access to. But that would take a few days of work.

>>>>>

>>>>> Before taking either step, I wanted to present this to you, and ask for your guidance.

>>>>>

>>>>> Note: "TK" is a placeholder for "to come," in case you are not familiar with that copyeditor's notation.

>>>>>

>>>>> \*

>>>>>

>>>>> AVIVA CHOMKSY

>>>>>

>>>>> Imperial Ambitions (shared with David Barsamian) Royalties of

>>>>> December 31, 2017: 12,256 units (cumulative dollars TK)

>>>>>

>>>>> Language and Mind Third edition

>>>>> TK

>>>>>

>>>>> New Military Humanism

>>>>> Royalties as of December 31, 2005 (publisher stopped paying and

>>>>> book went OP): 14,536 units (cumulative dollars TK)

>>>>>

>>>>> On Nature and Language

>>>>> TK

>>>>>

>>>>> Power Systems

>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2017: 28,418 units (cumulative dollars

>>>>> TK)

>>>>>

>>>>> What We Say Goes

>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2017: 39,155 units (cumulative dollars

>>>>> TK)

>>>>>

>>>>>

>>>>> DIANE CHOMSKY / DIANE CHOMSKY REVOCABLE TRUST / DIANE CHOMSKY

>>>>> 2009 TRUST

>>>>>

>>>>> Chomsky on Mis-Education

>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2007: 11,475 units (paper) and 8,006

>>>>> units (cloth) (cumulative dollars TK) \*I don't have access to  
>>>>> reports after 2007  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Language and Mind (Into the Classroom edition) TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Minimalist Program  
>>>>> Royalties of March 31, 2018: 14,389 units (cumulative dollars TK)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Myth of Liberal Media VHS and DVD TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> New Horizons in the Study of Language and Mind TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Powers and Prospects  
>>>>> Royalties as of December 31, 2017: \$1,341  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Profit Over People  
>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2007: 127,774 units (cumulative dollars  
>>>>> TK)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Rogue States  
>>>>> Royalties as of December 31, 2017: \$1,756  
>>>>>  
>>>>> HARRY CHOMSKY  
>>>>> none individually  
>>>>>  
>>>>> CHOMSKY GRANDCHILDREN NOMINEE TRUST  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Failed States  
>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2007: 153,635 units (cumulative dollars  
>>>>> TK)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> AVIVA CHOMSKY, DIANE CHOMSKY, HARRY CHOMSKY (in equal thirds)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Hegemony or Survival  
>>>>> Royalties of December 31, 2007: 339,244 units (cumulative dollars  
>>>>> TK)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Rules and Representations  
>>>>> TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> On Language (19% each)  
>>>>> TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> CHOMSKY CHILDREN'S TRUST #2  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Reflections on Language (subsumed by On Language, see above)  
>>>>>  
>>>>> Towards a New Cold War  
>>>>> TK  
>>>>>  
>>>>> \*  
>>>>>  
>>>>> best  
>>>>> Anthony  
>>>>>  
>>>>>  
>>>>> \_\_\_\_\_  
>>>>>

>>>>> If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.

>>>>  
>>>>  
>>>>  
>>>>

>>>> If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.

>>>  
>>>  
>>>

>>> If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.

>>  
>>  
>>

>> If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.

>  
>  
>  
>

> If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.

---

If you are not the intended recipient of the confidential and privileged information in this email please delete it, notify us immediately by return email and do not copy, use or disseminate such information. Pursuant to IRS Circular 230, any tax advice in this email or attachments may not be used to avoid tax penalties or to promote, market or recommend any matter addressed herein.